The Emergence of Multiple Text Manuscripts

A conference at the *Centre for the Study of Manuscript Cultures*
Warburgstraße 26, Hamburg

9-12 November, 2016

Tentative Programme

Wednesday, 9 November 2016 (room 0001)

5.00 pm   Registration

6:00 pm   Welcome & Introduction

6.15 pm   *Chair:* Eva Wilden, Hamburg
Nalini Balbir, Paris:
"Functions of Multiple Text Manuscripts in India: the Jain case"

8.00 pm   Dinner

Thursday, 10 November 2016 (room 0001)

9.00 am   *Chair:* Cécile Michel, Paris

Niek Veldhuis, Berkeley
Multiple-Composition School Extracts from Mesopotamia

Matthieu Husson, Paris
Erfurt F.377, a Late Medieval MTM in Mathematical Astronomy

10.45 am   Coffee Break

11.15 am   *Chair:* Bruno Reudenbach, Hamburg

Matthew Crawford, Melbourne
The Eusebian Canon Tables as a Corpus-Organizing Paratext within the Multiple-Text Manuscript of the Fourfold Gospel

Paola Buzi, Rome
The Ninth-Century Coptic Book Revolution and the Emergence of MTMs

1.00 pm   Lunch

2.45 pm   *Chair:* Christian Brockmann, Hamburg

Lara Sels, Leuven
The Emergence of MTMs in Slavonic: On Mixed Content Manuscripts and Erotapokriseis

Francesca Maltomini, Florence
Poetic MTMs in the Byzantine era

4.30 pm   Coffee Break

5.00 pm   Chair: Philippe Depreux, Hamburg

Paolo Divizia, Brno
Textual Units of Transmission vs. Texts. Normalizing Apparent Anomalies and Particular Cases in Textual Transmission

Lucie Doležalová, Prague
Selection, Association, and Memory: Personal MTMs in Late Medieval Bohemia

8.00 pm   Dinner

Friday, 11 November 2016 (room 0001)

9.00 am   *Chair:* Michael Friedrich, Hamburg

Donald Harper, Chicago
Ephemera or illustrated multiple-text-manuscript? The case of the "Hakutaku hikai zu"
白澤避怪圖 *(White Marsh diagram to repel prodigies) in Edo Japan*

Imre Galambos, Cambridge
Multiple Text Manuscripts from Medieval China

10.45 am   Coffee Break

11.15 am   *Chair:* Giuseppe Veltri, Hamburg

Andreas Lehnardt, Mainz
Hebrew and Aramaic MTMs Discovered in Binding Fragments

Ronny Vollandt, Munich
MTMs in the Judaeo- and Christian Arabic Tradition

1.00 pm   Lunch

2.45 pm   *Chair:* Sonja Brentjes, Berlin
François Déroche, Paris
The Prince and the Scholar. About the Use of Miscellanies in Late Medieval Marocco
Konrad Hirschler, Berlin
Composing / Editing Arabic Multiple-Text Manuscripts in the Late Medieval Period

4.30 pm   Coffee Break

5.00 pm   *Chair:* Jürgen Paul, Hamburg

Nuria Martinez de Castilla, Madrid
Morisco Single Volume Libraries

Lucia Raggetti, Berlin
Rolling Stones Do Gather: MS Instanbul Aya Sofya 3610 and Its Collection of Mineralogical Texts

8.00 pm   Dinner

Saturday, 12 November 2016 (room 0001)

9.00 am   *Chair:* Alessandro Bausi, Hamburg

Nikolay Dobronravin, St. Petersburg
*A Fluid Standard: Text Selection in the **kundi** Manuscript Books in Brazil*

Alessandro Gori, Copenhagen
*Text Collections in the Arabic Manuscript Tradition of Harar: the Case of the **Mawlid** Collection and of šayḫ Hāšim's al-Fatḥ al-Raḥmānī*

10.45 am   Coffee Break

11.15 pm   *Chair:* Marilena Maniaci, Cassino

Alexandra Gillespie, Toronto
Bookbinding as Codicology – Medieval English Manuscripts and the Case of Chaucer's Canterbury Tales

Final Discussion

Discussants: Sonja Brentjes, Berlin and Marilena Maniaci, Cassino

Abstracts

1. Balbir, Nalini (Paris, EPHE)
   Functions of Multiple Texts Manuscripts in India: the Jain Case

   The Jain manuscript culture is one of the most productive in India. The issue of multiple texts manuscripts, which are numerous and diverse in this religious tradition, has never been really addressed although it is a reality which can be observed first in palm leaf manuscripts (11th-14th centuries) and then in paper manuscripts (14th c. onwards). They raise practical problems for which the authors of manuscript catalogues have to take editorial decisions, as we will show. The main part of the paper, however, will focus on the functions of these manuscripts, the ways the selections are made and what they tell us about dynamics of knowledge. Examples will be taken mainly from the areas of liturgical texts and canonical scriptures.

2. Buzi, Paola (Sapienza University of Rome)
   The Ninth-Century Coptic Book Revolution and the Emergence of MTMs

   It is a matter of fact that until the end of the eighth century multiple-text manuscripts are not common in the Coptic tradition, the Nag Hammadi codices (third-fourth cent.) being an exception that can be explained with the specific necessities of the milieu in which they were produced.
   We will try to investigate the cultural reasons of the emergence of the miscellaneous Coptic codices, the cultural centres where they were produced, and the finalities for which they were created. The paratextual and graphical devices used in this new kind of books will be also taken into consideration. Lastly, some case-studies will be analysed more in details, such as some examples of monothematic miscellanies.

3. Crawford, Matthew (Melbourne, Australian Catholic University)
   The Eusebian Canon Tables as a Corpus-Organizing Paratext within the Multiple-Text Manuscript of the Fourfold Gospel

   If multiple-text manuscripts are an attempt at "corpus organization", the mere compilation of multiple texts within a single physical artefact does not always suffice to accomplish this goal. In fact, it may sometimes only make more acute the need for further disambiguation among its constituent parts. So it was for a codex containing the fourfold gospel, as a result of the distinct literary problem posed by the *tetraevangelium*. At some point in the mid-third century, for the first time the gospels according to Matthew, Mark, Luke, and John were placed together in a single codex, forming an MTM that would eventually become a standard feature of the diverse array of Christian traditions in late antiquity and beyond. Yet these four texts were in some ways so similar to one another, and yet each distinct, that readers were prone to confuse them, effectively eliding the distinct contribution they each made to the collective corpus. This confusion also occurred at the scribal level, as can be seen in the tendency of scribes to conflate the texts in the process of copying new manuscripts. Hence, this was an MTM that required some further means of clarifying the relationship of these four texts to one another, something, that is, to stabilize and codify the diversity of the component parts. To meet this challenge in the early fourth century the Christian bishop and historian Eusebius of Caesarea created an ingenious marginal apparatus that numbered passages within each gospel consecutively and then collated these numbers in ten tables according to how the passages in each gospel related to those from the other three. The resulting "Canon Tables" were without precedent in the prior Greco-Roman literary tradition, and so represented the first numerically based cross-referencing system for a corpus of texts. Understandably then, the Canon

Tables became wildly popular and within three centuries were being copied in gospelbooks from Ethiopia to Armenia to Ireland. This paper will argue that it was precisely the literary problem posed by the fourfold gospel as an MTM that led to this remarkable advance in information technology. That is, the Eusebian Canon Tables were a paratext created to order and so make harmonious the potentially confusing and ambiguous textual data contained in this unique MTM.

4. Déroche, François (Paris, EPHE)
   The Prince and the Scholar. About the Use of Miscellanies in Late Medieval Morocco
   Two miscellanies in the Escorial collection share some texts that could be defined as "classics" in their own field. However, the ownership turns to be quite different in these two cases. What do the two manuscripts tell us about their owners, the organisation of the material within the manuscript and the use of miscellanies in a Late Medieval Moroccan context?

5. Divizia, Paolo (Brno, Masaryk University)
   Textual Units of Transmission vs. Texts. Normalizing Apparent Anomalies and Particular Cases in Textual Transmission
   When studying the transmission of a text we usually tend to focus on that text, as if the identity of text and textual unit of transmission were taken for granted. This might be the case, but it has to be proved. A significant shared innovation proves the connection of two or more witnesses only in the exact point where it occurs, or better it is an argument whose strength is at its maximum in the exact point where it occurs and then becomes more and more feeble in proportion to the distance from that point, unless other such shared innovations are found in different sections of the "text" that is being studied. The boundary of such a proof does not necessarily correspond with the boundary of the text: it can be narrower than that of the text (if a change of model has occurred in the transmission) or it can be wider (if two or more consecutive texts have been copied together from the same model). While only the first phenomenon can occur in single-text manuscripts, multi-text manuscripts can present both phenomena and show how a research focused on the modern concept of text can be misleading.

6. Dobronravin, Nikolay (Saint Petersburg State University)
   A Fluid Standard: Text Selection in the *kundi* Manuscript Books in Brazil
   The *kundi* type of manuscripts in West Africa has been described as "small note book for any serious students / a library for senior scholars for the preservation of their special documents" (Aliyu Muhammad Bunza 2007). All the surviving manuscript books used by the African Muslims in nineteenth-century Brazil also belong to the *kundi* tradition in both format and contents. The selection of texts in these manuscripts is apparently based on a fluid standard. A Brazilian *kundi* includes shorter Qur'anic suras of the Qur'an as well as Qur'anic quotations used as prayers. Besides, the abracadabra and non-Arabic prayers as well as Islamic literary quotations are also found in such manuscripts. The selection of quotations demonstrates that the West African *kundi* legacy was preserved in the New World.

7. Doležalová, Lucie (Prague, Charles University)
   Selection, Association, and Memory: Personal MTMs in Late Medieval Bohemia
   Using examples of the work of specific authors/compilers from Bohemia (e.g., Ulricus Crux de Telcz, d. 1504, or Mattheus Beran, d. 1461, both Augustinian Canons, the former of Třeboň, the latter of Roudnice nad Labem), this paper argues that late medieval MTMs reflect the ways in which their creators processed the information boom of the time and that they contain manifestations of important mental processes of knowledge organization, namely selection and order, association, and memory.

Did these authors/compilers write primarily for themselves or did they try to make the books approachable to other readers? What was their conception of communicability and coherence? And how can we know that – that is, what strategies do we use to specify the overall intention behind MTMs and the level of their coherence, and with what implications?

8. Galambos, Imre (Cambridge University)
Multiple Text Manuscripts from Medieval China
Among the vast collection of manuscripts recovered from the Buddhist cave complex near the city of Dunhuang, there are numerous examples of single manuscripts containing several distinct texts. Some of these are written in the same hand, indicating a conscious effort to bring existing sources into a single collection or anthology, while others are written by different people and may date to different times. This paper will focus on a particular subset of such manuscripts, namely the ones copied by students as writing exercise, as it is evidenced either by the colophons or the types of texts. My aim is to demonstrate that in such cases the motivation for the production of such single-manuscript collections and their social function are more important for understanding the nature of the collections than the texts themselves. Consequently, even if the texts seem to be completely unrelated in terms of their content, they still have a close connection by virtue of how they were produced.

9. Gillespie, Alexandra (University of Toronto)
Bookbinding as Codicology - Medieval English Manuscripts and the Case of Chaucer's Canterbury Tales
The central argument of this paper is that the study of bookbinding tends, at least in late medieval European codicology, to be adjacent to but not fully integrated in a broad investigation of the medieval book. Surviving books almost always contain some evidence of their early history as bound (or unbound) objects—from unused stitching holes to the wear and tear associated with fascicular or 'booklet' production. And yet this evidence is often excluded from discussions of the production, assembly, distribution or conceptualization of manuscripts.
In order to demonstrate how fruitful a codicological practice that took better account of bookbinding might be, I will consider the case of two of the earliest manuscripts of Chaucer's *Canterbury Tales*: Aberystwyth, National Library of Wales, MS 392D and Cambridge University Library, MS Dd.4.24. My focus will be evidence of preparation of both books for the bindery and the interruption of that process by the late addition of revised textual material. For context, I will also present evidence from a range of late medieval manuscripts that were tacketed or archive-stitched into parchment covers, and another copy of the *Tales* that appears to have been assembled from such booklets, San Marino, CA, Huntington Library MS HM 144.

10. Gori, Alessandro (University of Copenhagen)
Text Collections in the Arabic Manuscript Tradition of Harar: the Case of the *Mawlid* Collection and of *šayḫ* Hāšim's *al-Fatḥ al-Raḥmānī*
The Arabic manuscript culture in Harar (eastern Ethiopia) can be traced back to the beginning of the 18th century at least. In learning and teaching institutions and higher educational establishments (Koranic schools, sufi shrines and madrasas) works of the wider Arabic-Islamic literature were copied by Harari scribes and texts of Harari authors were written down.
The devotional or pietistic genre is by far the most widespread in the Arabic literature circulating in Harar: manuscripts of Harar contain a conspicuous quantity of devotional hymns, invocations, long and short poems and compositions in rhyming prose. Groups of these texts are very often copied together in manuscripts so to create more or less standardized collections or text constellations which come to be identified as separate corpora to be

communally read, recited or sung during the pious meetings of the mystic brotherhoods (*ḥaḍra*) and the most important public religious festivities (the birthday of the Prophet, the annual remembrance of a holy man, the 10 last nights of the month of *ramaḍān*) but also on more secular and private occasions (e.g. weddings, funerals).

The presentation focuses on two Arabic devotional text collections diffused in the city of Harar: the *Mawlid* collection essentially composed by non-Harari Arabic texts and the constellation of the *Fatḥ al-Raḥmānī* by the Harari author *šayḫ* Hāšim. Both collections are extremely cherished by the Hararis and very often copied in manuscripts. After the Second World War they came also to be printed in Addis Ababa in several editions thanks to the efforts of Harari learned men and wealthy merchants.

I will propose an analysis and assessment of the so far know manuscript tradition of these two collections and try to detect and describe a tendency towards the creation of standardized and canonized corpora.

The influence exerted on the manuscript tradition by the ceremonial usage of most of the texts included in the two collections and the relationship between the manuscript tradition and the printed versions will also be discussed.

11. Harper, Donald (University of Chicago)
Ephemera or illustrated multiple-text-manuscript? The case of the "Hakutaku hikai zu" 白澤避怪圖 (White Marsh diagram to repel prodigies) in Edo Japan
The popular use of portraits of the protector-spirit Baize 白澤 (White Marsh) in medieval China had an unusual second life in Edo Japan during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries in an item of ephemera that went by the name "Hakutaku hikai zu" 白澤避怪圖 (White Marsh diagram to repel prodigies; hereafter HHZ). The HHZ had a conventionalized form in three parts: the title itself appearing prominently either down the right side of the scroll or sheet of paper on which the HHZ was produced or across the top, passages from three distinct texts (always the same texts) placed either to the left of the title or below it, and the depiction of White Marsh either on the left side or the bottom of the HHZ. The texts can be traced to dateable Chinese sources: the first, an account of the White Marsh legend; the second, a quotation from a Song dynasty book of family instructions which explains the custom of hanging portraits of White Marsh on a wall in the home to protect the household from demons and other prodigies; the third, an occult method to control demons and prodigies by listing their names for people to shout, thereby eliminating the harm. The HHZ was a popular item of ephemera, occurring in cheaply produced printed broadsheets as well as in scrolls produced by people both ordinary and famous. At the same time, the text portion is quoted as if the HHZ were a book, or more precisely, a multiple-text-manuscript or print object. The new field of ephemera studies has focused attention on the question of what differentiates ephemera from books. The HHZ blurs the boundary between ephemera, multiple-text-manuscript, and book.

12. Hirschler, Konrad (Freie Universität Berlin)
Composing/Editing Arabic Multiple-Text Manuscripts in the Late Medieval Period
Two large-scale documentary booklists from the Arabic Middle East have survived for the period up to 1500: the catalogue of the Ashrafiya Library in Damascus (13th century) and the endowment list of the scholar Ibn 'Abd al-Hadi (15th century) in the same city. Both these two booklists deal with a considerable number of MTMs in their collections, but they do so in radically different ways. The Ashrafiya cataloguer's beautifully devised ordering

system hit the wall when he came to the shelves with MTMs as he was clearly at loss on how to integrate them in a system devised for single-text manuscripts. For Ibn 'Abd al-Hadi in contrast a 'book' was first and foremost a MTM and for him there was no question that his list had to be organized around them.

This paper takes these two very different approaches to MTMs as a starting point to argue for a gradual shift in textual production during the late medieval period. While MTMs had existed since the very beginnings of Arabic manuscripts culture we observe in this period a distinctive shift where the MTM became the default textual format. This shift goes back to several factors, among them changing reading habits which favored 'one-volume libraries' and changing scholarly ideas of how to transmit knowledge. The booklist of Ibn 'Abd al-Hadi shows how a scholar strategically composed MTMs where his own literary output was carefully interwoven with the 'grand' texts.

13.   Husson, Matthieu (CNRS, SYRTE-Observatoire de Paris)
      Erfurt F. 377, a Late Medieval MTM in Mathematical Astronomy

      The manuscript now kept under the shelf mark Folio 377 in Erfurt Amploniana library is composed of three codicological units, two of which are multiple texts: A central part copied in Paris during the years 1320 was enclosed between two others dated to the 15th century and then bound together. Overall the manuscript covers the contents of late medieval astronomy: cosmology, instruments, astrology, tables and arithmetical tools. However these topics are not evenly distributed in the different codicological units: the central 14th c. part is mainly concerned with mathematical astronomy (instruments, tables and arithmetical tools) while the 15th c. parts address cosmology and astrology. These differences allow us to sketch the various intellectual projects which shaped the manuscript other more than a century before it was finally bound. Other contrasts between and within each codicological units, notably an analysis of the hands, colophons and diagrams, are telling especially with respect to the specific kinds of context where the codicological units were first produced. The 14th c. reflects a highly personalised teaching context in a master to student relationship while the 15th c. parts attest probably a more institutionalised setting.

14.   Lehnardt, Andreas (Johannes Gutenberg-Universität Mainz)
      Hebrew and Aramaic MTMs Discovered in Binding Fragments

      During the search for Hebrew binding fragments in German archives and libraries some MTMs preserved in bindings of incunabula and manuscripts have been discovered. These texts are witnesses of use and re-use of manuscripts and provide also interesting information on how Jewish manuscripts were studied, copied and neglected.

15.   Maltomini, Francesca (University of Florence)
      Poetic MTMs in the Byzantine Era

      The paper focuses on some Byzantine manuscripts consisting of collections of Greek poetic texts. The combined analysis of the texts (in terms of contents and chronology), of their 'treatment' (level of the book-production, presence of paratexts etc.) and of their order within each collection will provide some information on how MTMs of this kind were conceived and used. In a few cases, we are also able to follow various steps in the transmission of these collections, and to observe how and to what extent they were manipulated and reshaped.

16.   Nuria Martinez de Castilla (Madrid, Complutense University)
      Morisco Single Volume Libraries

      Although the manuscript production of the Moriscos, the last Muslim communities of Spain in the 16th and 17th centuries, does include some

unitary or composite manuscripts, roughly 90 per cent is made up by miscellanies. They are compilations of various kinds of knowledge with a common thread that can be more or less clearly defined. Formats and sizes vary widely and most of these miscellaneous volumes seem to have been prepared upon the request of a specific patron.

In this paper, I shall examine closely the topics which were relevant for the Moriscos and how they were organized within the volumes. I shall devote a special attention to the miscellanies produced by the same copyist around the same themes in order to address three main points: the origin of the models (that is to say whether they originate from the same textual tradition or not), the language used and the reason behind this choice and the identity of those in charge of the selection of the texts.

Some concluding remarks about the composition processes and the contents of these miscellanies that enjoyed so much success within the Morisco communities will enable us to understand better what they saw as the core of their religion and culture.

17. Raggetti, Lucia (Freie Universität Berlin)
    ### Rolling Stones Do Gather: MS Istanbul Aya Sofya 3610 and Its Collection of Mineralogical Texts
    Pre-modern mineralogy encompassed a much larger spectrum of topics than the modern one. The knowledge of stones included their medical and alchemical use, lexicography, useful and wondrous properties, and talisman making. Arabo-Islamic mineralogy of the 9th and 10th century was shaped by Pahlawi, Greek and Indian sources that were received, translated, and they often inspired original compositions in Arabic.

    The MS Aya Sofya 3610 is a Mamluk manuscript, whose copy was completed in 888 H./1483 A.D., witnessing a long-lasting interest for this kind of lore transmitted by fluid traditions. It includes a selection of texts that is representative of almost all the aspects and streams of tradition present in the early Arabo-Islamic mineralogy.

    The same combination and sequence of texts is to be found in other MTMs, for instance MS BNF Paris Ar. 2775 that, thanks to its composite nature, provides a particularly interesting and relevant comparandum.

18. Sels, Lara (KU Leuven)
    ### The Emergence of MTMs in Slavonic: On Mixed Content Manuscripts and Erotapokriseis
    The earliest known Slavonic manuscripts are of the late 10th and 11th centuries – there are no traces of a developed written culture before the conversion of the Slavs in the ninth (South Slavs) and tenth (East Slavs) centuries. Among the earliest dated Slavonic manuscripts are two famous florilegia – viz. the so-called *Izbornik* of 1073 and that of 1076, both copied for Svjatoslav II of Kiev (1073-1076) but generally accepted to go back to 10th-century Bulgarian models, written under Simeon the Great of Bulgaria (893-927). Whereas one of these *sborniki* – viz. the collection of 1076 – is a compilation of texts already translated from Greek in the first century of Slav Christianity, the other – that of 1073 – reflects the translation of an existing Greek collection (the *Sotèrios*). These huge compendia, which testify to the Slavonic reception (and excerption) of Byzantine Christianity, clearly mark the early development of Slavonic written culture and already point to later developments, e.g., in non-liturgical, mixed content manuscripts.

    The *Izbornik* of 1073 – with its many patristic texts on basic Christian dogma, with its Decalogue, its entries on the prophets, the apostles and the church councils – has been termed a "religious encyclopaedia" – it seems to have been compiled to provide an essential guide to Christian faith and behavior. The miscellany of 1076 is less theological-dogmatic in content – it is more concerned with the kind of "profitable teachings" found in apophtegmata,

gnomological texts, edifying hagiographies and homilies. However, one of the elements characteristic to both miscellanies is an erotapocritic core. These *erotapokriseis* or Question-and-answers appear in more than one regard as "miniature florilegia" within the florilegia (esp. in the *Izbornik* of 1073, where each question has been expanded by a string of quotations from Scripture and the Fathers), and the questions they raise are relevant to our thinking about MTMs. Not only do they touch upon similar technical issues concerning the selection and (re)arrangement of texts and textual transmission, they further evoke similar fundamental questions concerning conceptions of text (e.g. segmentation and 'agglutination' of text), the (re)generation of meaning (e.g. by the apposition of certain texts to others), knowledge transfer and construction.

A later, 14th-century translation of the *Soterios* (the Greek model of the *Izbornik* of 1073) – which has come down to us in one single codex (Berlin, Wuk 45), which is, in itself, a further expanded miscellany – will allow us to turn to later developments, especially in monastic (hesychast, anti-Latin) MTMs.

19. Veldhuis, Niek (Berkeley, University of California)
Multiple-Composition School Extracts from Mesopotamia

Cuneiform school texts from Mesopotamia tend to include extracts from multiple compositions. The patterns of text selection in these exercises allow for the reconstruction of how these compositions were studied and in what order. This, in turn, helps in understanding the purpose of these exercises and the goals of scribal education.

20. Vollandt, Ronny (Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München)
MTMs in the Judaeo- and Christian Arabic tradition

In the field of Judaeo- and Christian Arabic Studies the practice of multiple text manuscripts has not received much attention. In my contribution I shall attempt to present a number of examples of these two tradition